

## CHANGING ETHICAL AND RECUSAL RULES FOR SUPREME COURT JUSTICES

March 17, 2011

Senator Patrick Leahy  
Chairman, Senate Judiciary Committee  
433 Russell Senate Office Building  
Washington, DC 20510

Representative Lamar Smith  
Chairman, House Judiciary Committee  
2409 Rayburn House Office Building  
Washington, DC 20515

Senator Charles Grassley  
Ranking Member, Senate Judiciary  
Committee  
135 Hart Senate Office Building  
Washington, DC 20510

Representative John Conyers, Jr.  
Ranking Member, House Judiciary  
Committee  
2426 Rayburn H.O.B.  
Washington, DC 20515

Dear Chairmen and Ranking Minority Members,

Justices of the United States Supreme Court have not adopted and are not subject to a comprehensive code of judicial ethics. Nor are denials of motions to recuse by individual justices required to be in writing or subject to review. Recent media reports have focused public attention on this situation. The purpose of this letter is to issue a nonpartisan call for the implementation of mandatory and enforceable rules to protect the integrity of the Supreme Court.

Canon 1 of the Code of Conduct for United States Judges explains the importance of judicial ethics:

An independent and honorable judiciary is indispensable to justice in our society. A judge should maintain and enforce high standards of conduct and should personally observe those standards, so that the integrity and independence of the judiciary may be preserved.

This Code of Conduct is applicable to all federal judges *except* Supreme Court justices.

Decisions of Supreme Court justices have the broadest impact, are frequently divisive, and often turn on the vote of a single justice. Yet, while all other federal judges are required to abide by the Code of Conduct, and are subject to investigation and sanctions for failure to do so, Supreme Court justices look to the Code for mere “guidance,” and are not obligated to follow the Code’s rules.

Ethical conduct by judges is essential to the integrity of all courts, as the Supreme Court recently recognized in *Caperton v. A.T. Massey Coal Co.*:

“Courts, in our system, elaborate principles of law in the course of resolving disputes. The power and the prerogative of a court to perform this function rest, in the end, upon the respect accorded to its judgments. The citizen’s respect for judgments depends in turn upon the issuing court’s absolute probity. Judicial

integrity is, in consequence, a state interest of the highest order.”<sup>1</sup>

In light of the role the Code of Conduct plays in protecting the integrity of the judiciary, justices on our nation’s highest court should set the standard for judicial ethics by adhering to the same ethical rules as other judges. In our view, voluntarily looking to the Code of Conduct for “guidance” has proved insufficient.

Similarly, justices must be subject to an enforceable, transparent process governing recusal. The impartiality of justices, and, as a result, the integrity of the Supreme Court, has come under question because the primary recusal statute – 28 U.S.C. § 455 – fails to meet this standard for Supreme Court justices. On recusal motions, justices may sit in silent judgment of their own impartiality, with no opportunity for review, even though the standard to be applied is the *appearance* of bias, which by necessity depends on the views of others.

*Caperton* illustrates the hazards of allowing self-judging on recusal questions. In that case, a West Virginia Supreme Court justice, acting alone, denied multiple motions to recuse himself, despite benefitting from substantial campaign contributions made directly or indirectly by the president of a company with an outstanding \$50 million judgment against it on appeal before the judge. He then sided with the company in a 3-2 decision vacating the judgment. The Supreme Court reversed on due process grounds, holding that the justice’s view of his own impartiality did not matter so much as whether the appearance of his impartiality was compromised.<sup>2</sup> Critically, the Court held that an independent inquiry was needed “where, as here, there is no procedure for judicial fact-finding *and the sole trier of fact is the one accused of bias.*”<sup>3</sup>

Unlike *Caperton*, where the Supreme Court reversed the self-judged view of a single state court judge, there is no review procedure for recusal decisions by Supreme Court justices. Individual justices rule themselves on motions to recuse, or decide *sua sponte* to recuse in cases where no motion is filed. No written opinion is required in either situation. The opacity and non-reviewability of this process erodes public confidence in the integrity of the Court. The fundamental principle that “no man may be a judge in his own case” was articulated by Lord Coke in the seventeenth century, yet inexplicably we still allow Supreme Court justices to be the sole judge of themselves on recusal issues.

Adherence to mandatory ethical rules by justices, and requiring transparent, reviewable recusal decisions that do not turn solely on the silent opinion of the challenged justice will reinforce the integrity and legitimacy of the Supreme Court. Therefore, we strongly urge your committees to hold hearings and advance legislation to:

1. Apply the Code of Conduct for United States Judges to Supreme Court justices;

---

<sup>1</sup> *Caperton v. A.T. Massey Coal Co.*, \_\_\_ U.S. \_\_\_, 129 S. Ct. 2252, 2266-67 (2009) (quoting *Republican Party of Minn. v. White*, 536 U.S. 765, 793 (2002)). “State” interest in this setting meant governmental interest.

<sup>2</sup> A public opinion poll found that 67% of West Virginians doubted the judge would be fair and impartial. *Id.* at 2258.

<sup>3</sup> *Id.* at 2263 (emphasis added).

\* School affiliations are listed for identification purposes only, and shall not be construed as the endorsement of any institution.

2. Establish a set of procedures to enforce the Code's standards as applied to Supreme Court justices;
3. Require a written opinion when a Supreme Court justice denies a motion to recuse; and
4. Determine a procedure, or require the Court to do so, that provides for review of a decision by a Supreme Court justice not to recuse himself or herself from a case pending before the Court.

Sincerely,

Mark N. Aaronson  
Professor of Law  
University of California Hastings College of Law

Richard Abel  
Michael J. Connell Professor of Law Emeritus  
University of California at Los Angeles School of Law

James Alfini  
Dean Emeritus and Professor of Law  
South Texas College of Law

Michael Ambrosio  
Professor of Law  
Seton Hall University School of Law

Camille Spinello Andrews  
Associate Dean  
Rutgers School of Law - Camden

Robert H. Aronson  
Betts, Patterson & Mines Professor of Law  
University of Washington School of Law

E. Clinton Bamberger  
Emeritus Professor of Law  
University of Maryland School of Law

Larry D. Barnett  
Professor of Law  
Widener University School of Law

David Barnhizer  
Professor of Law Emeritus  
Cleveland-Marshall College of Law

Debra Lyn Bassett  
Justice Marshall F. McComb Professor of Law  
Southwestern Law School

Susan J. Becker  
Professor of Law  
Cleveland-Marshall College of Law

John S. Beckerman  
Visiting Professor and Associate Dean, 2001-09  
Rutgers School of Law - Camden

Anthony J. Bocchino  
Professor of Law  
Temple University Beasley School of Law

Carl T. Bogus  
Professor of Law  
Roger Williams University School of Law

Karen E. Boxx  
Associate Professor of Law  
University of Washington School of Law

Francis Catania  
Associate Professor of Law and Director of Judicial Externship  
Widener University School of Law

Gerard Clark  
Professor of Law  
Suffolk University Law School

Mary Clark  
Associate Professor of Law  
American University Washington College of Law

Robert H. Cole  
Professor of Law Emeritus  
University of California, Berkeley, School of Law

Liz Ryan Cole  
Professor and Director, Semester in Practice  
Vermont Law School

Robin Morris Collin  
Professor of Law; Director of the Certificate Program in Sustainability Law  
Willamette University College of Law

Robert J. Condlin  
Professor of Law  
University of Maryland School of Law

George W. Conk  
Adjunct Professor of Law & Senior Fellow, Stein Center for Law and Ethics  
Fordham Law School

Benjamin P. Cooper  
Assistant Professor of Law  
University of Mississippi School of Law

Roger Cramton  
Robert S. Stevens Professor of Law, Emeritus  
Cornell University Law School

Dennis E. Curtis  
Clinical Professor Emeritus and Professional Lecturer in Law  
Yale Law School

Patricia A. Daly  
Assistant Professor of Cooperative Education  
Earle Mack School of Law at Drexel University

Mary Dant  
Clinical Professor of Law  
Loyola Law School

Robert D. Dinerstein  
Professor of Law  
American University Washington College of Law

Lawrence Dubin  
Professor of Law  
University of Detroit Mercy School of Law

James Geoffrey Durham  
Professor of Law  
University of Dayton School of Law

Edward Eberle  
Professor of Law  
Roger Williams University School of Law

Pamela Edwards  
Professor of Law  
City University of New York School of Law

Jane H. Egly  
Professor of Law and Director of Clinical Programs  
University of LaVerne College of Law

James R. Elkins  
Professor of Law  
West Virginia University College of Law

Christopher M. Fairman  
Professor of Law  
Ohio State University Moritz College of Law

Hilary B. Farber  
Assistant Professor  
Northeastern University School of Law

Guillermo Figueroa  
Professor of Law  
University of Puerto Rico School of Law

Eric M. Fink  
Associate Professor of Law  
Elon University School of Law

John Flym  
Professor Emeritus  
Northeastern University School of Law

Patrick J. Flynn  
Associate Professor of Clinical Legal Studies  
University of South Carolina School of Law

Lawrence J. Fox  
George C. Crawford Lecturer in Law  
Yale Law School

David Frakt  
Associate Professor of Law  
Barry University School of Law

Amanda Frost  
Professor of Law  
American University Washington College of Law

Luis Fuentes-Rohwer  
Professor of Law  
Indiana University Maurer School of Law

Theresa Gabaldon  
Lyle T. Alverson Professor of Law  
George Washington University Law School

Ruben Garcia  
Professor of Law  
California Western School of Law

William S. Geimer  
Prof of Law Emeritus  
Washington and Lee University School of Law

Lauren Gilbert  
Professor of Law  
St. Thomas University School of Law

James W. Gordon  
Professor of Law  
Western New England College School of Law

Robert W. Gordon  
Chancellor Kent Professor of Law and Legal History  
Yale Law School

David J. Gottlieb  
Professor of Law  
University of Kansas School of Law

David A. Green  
Professor of Law  
North Carolina Central University School of Law

Stuart P. Green  
Professor of Law  
Rutgers School of Law - Newark

Vivien Gross  
Clinical Professor of Law  
Chicago-Kent College of Law

Leonard Gross  
Professor of Law  
Southern Illinois University School of Law

David Grossman  
Clinical Professor of Law  
Harvard Law School

Mark I. Harrison  
Adjunct Professor  
Arizona State University Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law

Melissa Hart  
Associate Professor and Director of the Byron White Center for the Study of American  
Constitutional Law  
University of Colorado Law School

Kevin Hopkins  
Associate Professor of Law  
John Marshall Law School

Cabanne Howard  
Assistant Professor and Executive Secretary, Maine Committee on Judicial Responsibility and  
Disability  
University of Maine School of Law

Joseph Richard Hurt  
Visiting Professor of Law  
Florida A & M University College of Law

Patrick Johnston  
Associate Professor  
Widener University School of Law

Donald K. Joseph  
Visiting Associate Professor  
Rutgers School of Law - Camden

Kimberly Kirkland  
Professor of Law  
University of New Hampshire School of Law

Susan P. Koniak  
Professor of Law  
Boston University School of Law

Linda Hamilton Krieger  
Professor of Law and Director, Ulu Lehua Scholars Program  
University of Hawai'i William S. Richardson School of Law

Charles Lawrence  
Professor of Law  
Georgetown University Law Center

Robert P. Lawry  
Professor of Law Emeritus  
Case Western Reserve University School of Law

Lisa G. Lerman  
Professor of Law and Coordinator of Clinical Programs  
Catholic University School of Law

John Leubsdorf  
Professor of Law and Judge Frederick B. Lacey Scholar  
Rutgers School of Law – Newark

John M. Levy  
Chancellor Professor of Law, Emeritus  
William and Mary Law School

Antoinette Sedillo Lopez  
Professor of Law  
University of New Mexico

Michael W. Loudenslager  
Associate Professor of Law  
Appalachian School of Law

David Luban  
Professor of Law and Philosophy  
Georgetown University Law Center

Steven Lubet  
Edna B. and Ednyfed H. Williams Memorial Professor  
Northwestern University School of Law

Susan R. Martyn  
Stoepler Professor of Law and Values  
The University of Toledo College of Law

Amy R. Mashburn  
Professor of Law  
University of Florida Levin College of Law

Judith Maute  
William J. Alley Professor of Law  
University of Oklahoma College of Law

Judith A. McMorrow  
Professor of Law  
Boston College Law School

Kevin McMunigal  
Judge Ben C. Green Professor of Law  
Case Western Reserve University School of Law

Carrie Menkel-Meadow  
Chancellor's Professor of Law  
University of California, Irvine School of Law and Georgetown University Law Center

James E. Moliterno  
Vincent Bradford Professor of Law  
Washington and Lee University School of Law

Muriel Morisey  
Associate Professor of Law  
Temple University Beasley School of Law

Alan B. Morrison  
Associate Dean for Public Interest & Public Service  
George Washington University Law School

Eleanor W. Myers  
Associate Professor of Law  
Temple University Beasley School of Law

Gregory J. O'Meara, S.J.  
Associate Professor of Law  
Marquette University Law School

Christine C. Pagano  
Faculty of Law  
Golden Gate University School of Law

Charles W. Wolfram  
Roger C. Park  
James Edgar Hervey Distinguished Professor of Law  
University of California, Hastings College of the Law

Roger Park  
James Edgar Hervey Distinguished Professor of Law  
University of California, Hastings College of Law

Joseph M. Perillo  
Distinguished Professor of Law  
Fordham Law School

Rex R. Perschbacher  
Professor & Daniel J. Dykstra Chair in Law  
University of California, Davis, School of Law

Gregory C. Pingree  
Professor of Law  
Florida Coastal School of Law

Lee A. Pizzimenti  
Associate Dean and Professor of Law  
University of Toledo College of Law

Charles R.P. Pouncy  
Associate Professor  
Florida International University College of Law

Burnele V. Powell  
Miles and Ann Loadholt Professor of Law  
University of South Carolina School of Law

Cedric Merlin Powell  
Professor of Law  
University of Louisville Brandeis School of Law

Robert Pugsley  
Professor of Law  
Southwestern Law School

Maritza Reyes  
Assistant Professor of Law  
Florida A&M University College of Law

Cruz Reynoso  
Boochever and Bird Professor of Law Emeritus  
University of California, Davis, School of Law

Deborah L. Rhode  
Ernest W. McFarland Professor of Law  
Stanford Law School

Paula R. Rhodes  
Associate Professor  
University of Denver Sturm College of Law

Howard I. Rosenberg  
Professor of Law  
University of Denver Sturm College of Law

Thomas Ross  
Professor of Law  
University of Pittsburgh School of Law

Paul Rothstein  
Professor of Law  
Georgetown University Law Center

Stephen Saltzburg  
Wallace and Beverley Woodbury University Professor  
George Washington University Law School

Jack L. Sammons  
Griffin B. Bell Professor of Law  
Mercer University School of Law

Herman Schwartz  
Professor of Law  
American University Washington College of Law

Marjorie Shultz  
Professor of Law Emerita  
University of California, Berkeley, Law School

Jay Silver  
Professor of Law  
St. Thomas University School of Law

William H. Simon  
Arthur Levitt Professor of Law  
Columbia Law School

Rima Sirota  
Associate Professor of Legal Research & Writing  
Georgetown University Law Center

Robin Wellford Slocum  
Professor of Law  
Chapman University School of Law

Linda F. Smith  
Professor & Clinical Program Director  
S. J. Quinney College of Law, University of Utah

Abbe Smith  
Professor of Law  
Georgetown University Law Center

Lloyd Snyder  
Professor of Law  
Cleveland-Marshall College of Law

Larry R. Spain  
Professor of Law  
Texas Tech University School of Law

James H. Stark  
Professor of Law  
University of Connecticut School of Law

Jeffrey W. Stempel  
Doris S. & Theodore B. Lee Professor of Law  
University of Nevada, Las Vegas William S. Boyd School of Law

Gary Stoneking  
Attorney at Law  
University of Minnesota Law School

Maura Strassberg  
Professor of Law  
Drake University Law School

Keith Swisher  
Assistant Professor of Law  
Phoenix School of Law

Ellen Taylor  
Associate Professor  
Georgia State University College of Law

Paula R. Tremblay  
Clinical Professor of Law  
Boston College Law School

Dennis J. Tuchler  
Professor of Law Emeritus  
Saint Louis University School of Law

Rodney Uphoff  
Elwood Thomas Missouri Endowed Professor of Law  
University of Missouri School of Law

Dennis Ventry  
Professor of Law  
University of California, Davis School of Law

Howard J. Vogel  
Professor of Law  
Hamline University School of Law

W. Bradley Wendel  
Professor of Law  
Cornell University Law School

Carwina Weng

Clinical Professor of Law  
Indiana University Maurer School of Law

Robert Westley  
Professor of Law  
Tulane University Law School

Penny J. White  
Director of the Center for Advocacy and Elvin E. Overton Distinguished Professor of Law  
University of Tennessee College of Law

Gary Williams  
Johnnie L. Cochran, Jr. Civil Rights Professor of Law  
Loyola Law School Los Angeles

Charles Frank Reavis Sr.  
Professor Emeritus  
Cornell University Law School

Ellen Yaroshefsky  
Clinical Professor of Law/Director Jacob Burns Ethics Center  
Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law

William Yeomans  
Fellow in Law and Government  
American University Washington College of Law

Peter Zablotsky  
Professor of Law  
Touro College Jacob D. Fuchsberg Law Center

Richard Zitrin  
Lecturer in Law  
University of California, Hastings College of the Law